



**Executive Summary Prepared by
Godly Response to Abuse in the Christian Environment¹
for International House of Prayer²**

January 31, 2019

¹ Godly Response to Abuse in the Christian Environment is also known as GRACE. Hereafter in this summary, we utilize our acronym GRACE. For more information about GRACE, see netgrace.org.

² Hereafter, we utilize the acronym IHOP.

I. Introduction, Scope, and Methodology

After news of sexual misconduct allegations surfaced in early 2018 regarding Brad Tebbutt, IHOP's then Director of the Simeon Company Internship,³ IHOP engaged GRACE on March 28, 2018 to conduct an independent investigation regarding these allegations. As described in the Engagement Agreement, IHOP engaged GRACE to:

*investigate any and all known allegations of sexual abuse and/or misconduct against Brad Tebbutt. The three areas of focus shall be 1) At or during the time Brad Tebbutt was employed at the former First Baptist Church of Modesto, California, 2) At or during the time Brad Tebbutt was employed by Horizon Christian High School, 23370 SW Boones Ferry Rd, Tualatin, OR, 97062, and 3) At or during the time Brad Tebbutt has been employed by IHOP. This shall be determined primarily through an online survey that shall be made available to a limited segment of the IHOP community to be identified and determined by agreement between GRACE and IHOP. The scope of this investigation shall also include a) whether IHOP had knowledge of any such allegations and how it responded, and b) assess the actions the current IHOP leadership has taken since being notified of the sexual abuse allegations against Brad Tebbutt.*⁴

In June, GRACE released a survey related to Part 3 of the investigation and inquired about IHOP's handling of and response to these allegations as noted in the Engagement Agreement. IHOP sent the survey to 311 individuals.⁵ To date, the survey was accessed 193 times. GRACE conducted 12 interviews. In the pages that follow, GRACE provides Findings of Fact, Analysis, and Recommendations related to the matters raised in this investigation.

II. Findings of Fact and Analysis Regarding the Allegations of Sexual Abuse and/or Misconduct against Brad Tebbutt

Findings of Fact Regarding Part 1: First Baptist Church of Modesto, California

GRACE reached out to the alleged victim (hereafter referred to as Jane Doe)⁶ and to three additional witnesses⁷ who reportedly have information regarding the allegations that are the subject of this investigation. None of these witnesses provided an interview to GRACE. GRACE also reached out to the alleged perpetrator, Brad Tebbutt. Mr. Tebbutt declined to speak with GRACE.⁸ The only information related to these allegations which was provided to GRACE comes from a) GRACE interviews with individuals who spoke to Mr. Tebbutt after these allegations surfaced, b) Mr. Tebbutt's internship application to IHOP in 2012, and c) additional materials provided to GRACE by IHOP relating to IHOP's preliminary research into these matters. These materials provided by IHOP include: a "Fact Sheet" created by Mr. Tebbutt in 2004 during his meetings with a psychologist,⁹ a 2005 polygraph report,¹⁰ a handful of emails and letters he reportedly exchanged with Jane Doe in

³ A witness who has participated in the Simeon Company Internship stated that this internship's focus is "to prepare for the end times, grow in the Lord, grow in spirituality, and for the Simeons, we also want to walk with the younger generation." IHOP's website similarly describes the goal of the internship and states, "The goal of this internship is to see each person filled with passion for Jesus, as well as turning toward the younger generation as a spiritual father or mother. We believe that unity between generations is an integral part of entering into the fullness of God's glory and plan for the Church." The Simeon Company internship is for individuals "Age: 50+." See <https://www.ihopkc.org/internships/simeon-company/>

⁴ See Engagement Agreement signed by IHOP and GRACE representatives on March 28, 2018.

⁵ The 311 number includes the IHOP Executive Leadership Team, IHOPU Executive Management Team, IHOPU Faculty and Admin Core, IHOP Security Department, past and present Simeon Company Leadership, Forerunner Church Leaders and IHOP Department Leaders, and past Simeon Company Interns.

⁶ Jane Doe has elected not to participate in the investigation due to the pendency of a lawsuit she filed against First Baptist Church of Modesto.

⁷ These witnesses were identified through news media reports about this matter. These witnesses were contacted but did not provide interviews to GRACE.

⁸ According to IHOP leaders, Mr. Tebbutt stated that he was unwilling to speak with GRACE because of his participation in the lawsuit against FBC Modesto. He "apologized for putting [IHOP] in a jam and that he was willing to bear the consequences."

⁹ If Mr. Tebbutt had agreed to speak with GRACE, GRACE could have asked about whether he possesses a number of items, including but not limited to, the psychologist's report and any and all communications between himself and Jane Doe.

¹⁰ Though polygraphs may be useful for a number of legitimate law enforcement purposes, polygraph examination results are nearly always inadmissible in court. As documented by the American Psychologist Association, "The accuracy, (i.e., validity) of polygraph testing has long been controversial. An underlying problem is theoretical: There is no evidence that any pattern of physiological reactions is unique to deception. An honest person may be nervous when answering truthfully and a dishonest person may be non-anxious.... Evidence indicates

2004, 2005, 2006, and 2009, and IHOP's "Due Diligence Report and Timeline" dated March 7, 2018. Apart from these data points, GRACE received no additional information pertaining to Part 1 of the scope from the Engagement Agreement. Because GRACE is unable provide information regarding these alleged events from any witness with primary knowledge, GRACE summarizes below the facts known to IHOP, as well as any additional information provided by witnesses to GRACE.

What is known from the accounts about these events provided by Mr. Tebbutt is that from the Summer of 1984 to the Summer of 1988, Mr. Tebbutt served FBC Modesto as a youth intern minister.¹¹ While he was a youth intern minister, he spent time with youth in the Junior High Ministry (August 1984 to August 1985), Ceres High School (September 1985 to May 1986), Byers High School (June 1986 to January 1988)¹² and also with adults in the Adult Ministries (February 1988 to May 1988). He alleges that in the Spring of 1987, when he was married and 28 years old, Jane Doe, who was then 15 years old, "came to us in great need. Her father had died, she had a fractured relationship with her mother, and she was just coming out of a hurtful dating relationship."¹³ He explained that he and his wife "took [Jane Doe] into our lives, almost in a parenting role."¹⁴ Mr. Tebbutt also described how Jane Doe stayed overnight in their home on at least two occasions. According to Mr. Tebbutt, when Jane Doe was 16 years old, on approximately five occasions during a period of "six to nine months," he was alone with Jane Doe and "involved inappropriately." Mr. Tebbutt described how he kissed and touched her breasts¹⁵ in his home.¹⁶ Mr. Tebbutt denies ever engaging in any sexual intercourse,¹⁷ which stands in stark contrast with Jane Doe's account that Mr. Tebbutt reportedly engaged in repeated acts of fondling and sexual intercourse beginning when she was 14 years old, during a time when she was still coping with the death of her father.¹⁸

IHOP's Due Diligence and Timeline Report provided to GRACE indicates that Mr. Tebbutt moved from FBC Modesto in the Summer of 1988 and began working in Alliance Church in Canada.¹⁹ In the Fall of 1988, Jane Doe reported what had taken place to FBC Modesto, and FBC Modesto leaders "confront[ed] [Mr. Tebbutt] and ha[d] him return to Modesto to repent to [Jane Doe] of the abuse."²⁰ Mr. Tebbutt eventually (in 2005, while working with the psychologist) made the observation that "it seems that we dealt with this situation more as a marital affair. We did not focus on the offense to a minor. Concern was expressed about our marriage.... No concerns were raised about future ministry or our working with students."²¹

In 1990, Mr. Tebbutt transitioned from Alliance Church in Canada to a church in Hillsboro, Oregon. In 1995, he was hired by a church in Puyallup. And in 1998, Mr. Tebbutt obtained employment with the Pacific Northwest Christian and Missionary Alliance in the Portland area where he served as the Youth and Children's Director until

that strategies used to 'beat' polygraph examinations, so-called countermeasures, may be effective." See *The Truth About Lie Detectors (aka Polygraph Tests)*, American Psychological Association, August 5, 2004.

¹¹ According to Mr. Tebbutt's internship application, he attended Golden Gate Baptist Theological Seminary in Mill Valley, CA during this same time period and received an M. Div. in 1988.

¹² Mr. Tebbutt explained that he was "responsible for students from Byer High School (about 80-100 kids)."

¹³ From the "Fact Sheet" authored by Mr. Tebbutt for his psychologist in 2005.

¹⁴ *Id.*

¹⁵ In 2005, Mr. Tebbutt indicated to the polygrapher that he "kissed and fondled her bare breasts." In 2018, after news of this story broke, IHOP staff members told GRACE that they understood from speaking with Mr. Tebbutt that the "inappropriate touching" was above Jane Doe's clothes.

¹⁶ From the "Fact Sheet" authored by Mr. Tebbutt for his psychologist in 2005. It is unclear from Mr. Tebbutt's description of these events in his Fact Sheet if any of these events occurred at other locations outside of his home.

¹⁷ Clearly, Jane Doe's reports (namely, sexual intercourse with a minor), if true, would be felonious criminal behavior. But for the statute of limitations, this alleged behavior is punishable by incarceration in the state penitentiary. Regardless, touching a minor's breast (even if it is over the clothes) is a felony in most states.

¹⁸ See <https://www.modbee.com/news/article202019094.html>, 2/24/18. See also Jane Doe's complaint which is a public record filed on 5/25/18, Case Number: CGC18566780, Superior Court of California, San Francisco, CA. According to the complaint, Jane Doe alleges that Mr. Tebbutt had sex with her in various locations, including his church office, his vehicle, and on an out of town trip.

¹⁹ During the course of this investigation, GRACE was notified of Mr. Tebbutt's time as a youth pastor in Canada, prior to moving to Kansas City. As a result of information provided to GRACE, GRACE reached out to IHOP to inquire about expanding the scope of this investigation to include Mr. Tebbutt's time in Regina, Canada. IHOP leaders told GRACE they had decided not to pursue any investigation in Canada. See email from IHOP to GRACE dated 4/24/18.

²⁰ See IHOP's Due Diligence and Timeline Report.

²¹ From the "Fact Sheet" authored by Brad Tebbutt for his psychologist in 2005.

2004.²² While employed by Christian and Missionary Alliance, Jane Doe reportedly reached out to Mr. Tebbutt in 2002 indicating a desire to connect. Mr. Tebbutt indicated that he hesitated to respond because of the church's admonition not to have further contact with Jane Doe. In 2004, Mr. Tebbutt "chose to dialogue with [Jane Doe]" and reportedly began some email correspondence in early 2004. At the end of April 2004, Jane Doe's pastor from the church she attended in Seattle "confronted me with the reality of the nature of what had happened and asked me to take responsibility and action. I agreed to do tis [sic], with a desire to encourage healing for myself and this young lady."²³ Mr. Tebbutt had not informed Christian and Missionary Alliance of his abuse of Jane Doe and so when these matters came to their attention, Mr. Tebbutt was asked to resign.²⁴ In 2004, as Mr. Tebbutt was in the process of joining Infusion Ministries, he was asked by the Director of Infusion Ministries to "undergo a psychological evaluation from [name of the psychologist] to find whether or not B.T. is a danger to youth."²⁵ Mr. Tebbutt left Infusion Ministries in 2009 and obtained employment at Horizon Christian School where he was a Bible teacher and campus pastor for three years.²⁶ In 2012, he applied to IHOP. According to Mr. Tebbutt, he has "[b]een in some form of youth ministry for 30 years."²⁷

When Mr. Tebbutt applied to IHOP as an intern in 2012, he was asked if he "ever received help for psychological, sexual, emotional, or relational problems," to which he responded "No."²⁸ Mr. Tebbutt was also asked about any accusations of physical or sexual abuse.²⁹ He replied that he engaged in "inappropriate touch" with a 16 year old girl in his youth ministry.³⁰ A year later, Mr. Tebbutt applied to be IHOP staff. The staff application did not ask about accusations of abuse, and Mr. Tebbutt did not voluntarily provide any information about this matter to IHOP at the time he was accepted as staff in 2013. Furthermore, no one in IHOP leadership reported knowing anything about these allegations when Mr. Tebbutt transitioned from staff to being named the Director of the Simeon Company Internship in 2015.³¹

After the news media contacted IHOP regarding these matters in Spring 2018, IHOP's Chief Operating Officer asked Mr. Tebbutt to come to his office and explain the matter. The Chief Operating Officer recalls that Mr. Tebbutt was somewhat "vague," which he found to be concerning. Mr. Tebbutt told the Chief Operating Officer that Jane Doe was 16 or 17 years old at the time. He explained that what occurred was "inappropriate" but was more of "an emotional connection." Mr. Tebbutt also indicated that the relationship was only "sexual" insofar as he was "married, kissing and [engaged in inappropriate touching]" with Jane Doe. The Chief Operating Officer's memory and understanding of how Mr. Tebbutt described these events was that the sexual contact was "above the clothes" and was "nothing below the belt." He also recalled that Mr. Tebbutt "confessed he wanted to have sex

²² See IHOP's Due Diligence and Timeline Report. See also Mr. Tebbutt's 2012 internship application.

²³ From the "Fact Sheet" authored by Brad Tebbutt for his psychologist in 2005.

²⁴ See IHOP's Due Diligence and Timeline Report. See also Mr. Tebbutt's internship application noting that he "resigned" from this position.

²⁵ The 2005 polygrapher's report indicates that Mr. Tebbutt was "now in therapy and wanting to prove that the sexual abuse was an isolated incident and that he never had intercourse with the victim."

²⁶ Mr. Tebbutt told IHOP that after the incident with Christian and Missionary Alliance, Mr. Tebbutt "always makes his employer aware of the events with [Jane Doe]." See IHOP's Due Diligence and Timeline Report.

²⁷ See 2012 internship application; see also "Personal Testimony" section wherein he stated that his "entire focus in ministry has been on youth and children."

²⁸ See 2012 internship application.

²⁹ The 2012 IHOP internship application asked, "Have you ever been accused of and/or reported for physically or sexually abusing someone?" Mr. Tebbutt checked the box for "Yes." The application further states, "If yes, provide details and circumstances of accusations/reports of abuse on a separate sheet," which Mr. Tebbutt did.

³⁰ Mr. Tebbutt explained in his internship application, "There was a situation while I was an intern in youth ministry in 1986/87 where I moved outside of my marriage to find emotional fulfillment. This was damaging as it not only violated my marriage with [my wife] but also involved a young girl who was 16 years old. Although my involvement with this young lady went no further than inappropriate touch, it definitely caused deep wounds for her and completely communicated a conflicting message of God's love and of her own sexuality. I have, on two occasions, taken steps to bring resolution and healing into her life and this situation. Our most recent communication has indicated God's redemptive work in her life has brought wholeness. This was an isolated situation in my life that caused me to make corrections and strengthen myself and my marriage. I have two men in my life who are familiar with this situation or have researched the specifics and walked with me through the most recent efforts of reconciliation. They would be happy to speak with you as references in this matter."

³¹ The President stated that as Director of the Simeon Company Internship, Mr. Tebbutt "was in a leadership role over about 10 interns who were ages 50 to 70" but was "never in a top leadership role in the IHOP organization."

[with Jane Doe] but it didn't go anywhere."

Mr. Tebbutt also described these events to his fellow Simeon leaders in the aftermath of these events being reported by the news media. These Simeon leaders were interviewed by GRACE and, though there were some differences, Simeon leaders generally recall that Mr. Tebbutt described these events in the following manner: that at the time, he was serving in a youth pastor role, that Jane Doe was 16 or 17 years old and was in his youth group, and that he engaged in "inappropriate touching" with her but the touching was on top of her clothes. They remember him indicating that these events occurred on more than one occasion, but most had the impression that it was not for an extended period of time, and as one noted, "it was not for months and months." These witnesses also recall that these events had transpired after Jane Doe's father had died. They also generally described Mr. Tebbutt's explanation of his actions following the sexual abuse in positive terms, stating that Mr. Tebbutt had "repented" and sought reconciliation and that Jane Doe initially accepted it but later did not grant forgiveness, although Mr. Tebbutt had made every effort to seek her forgiveness and to offer repentance. However, one individual who had been involved with the Simeon Company Internship and had spoken with Mr. Tebbutt after the news broke described an interaction with Mr. Tebbutt thusly:

I got the sense that [Mr. Tebbutt] felt like he had already dealt with all this in the past and he wasn't enjoying having to deal with it again. I was a little disappointed that he was not totally undone and saying 'God help me.' Not only for his sake, but for his wife's sake and for IHOP's sake. It was like he already learned how to manage, how to deal, how to contend with it. I guess in his mind it had all been completely dealt with. Meaning, he has learned how to manage it. I got the sense he was just waiting for the process to end so he can move forward. Kind of like moving on with what you all (GRACE) need to do and the leadership needs to do so he can get back into his position and get on with his life. I was a little disappointed that he was not more engaged with what everyone else was having to contend with.

Analysis of Part 1

Without the ability to interview any witnesses with first-hand information regarding the sexual misconduct allegations that were the impetus for this investigation, GRACE is unable to provide any analysis regarding the credibility of the alleged victim's and the alleged perpetrator's accounts. The remaining data points are statements provided by third parties to GRACE regarding this allegation. But, at a minimum, what is known is that Mr. Tebbutt's actions demonstrate that he utilized his position of power and authority as a youth intern minister to gain access to a minor in his care, to exploit her trust following the death of her father, and that he sexually violated the physical and emotional boundaries of a youth under his authority and care. Though Mr. Tebbutt characterized these events as "isolated" and as "mov[ing] outside of his marriage to find emotional fulfillment," Mr. Tebbutt's admissions indicate that his behavior was potentially criminal, and possibly worse than what he claims.³² As Jane Doe's youth minister, he had the obligation to care for her soul. Instead, he engaged in sexually abusing a minor while being in a position of spiritual authority. As Dr. Diane Langberg explains,

Clergy sexual abuse is an abuse of power and a desecration of the name of Christ. It is not an affair, nor is the victim equally culpable. The safety of God's sheep results from His character not theirs. And so it should be for the broken, confused, wounded sheep in our communities. They should be safe because of the shepherd's character and where they are not, a shepherd's character is exposed as being abusive of power, deceptive and clearly unlike the character of the one he calls Master.³³

In addition, Mr. Tebbutt's description of these events as "an emotional connection" or as "mov[ing] outside of [his] marriage to find emotional fulfillment," is a significant deception about his own responsibility and does not demonstrate any appreciation for the depravity and the devastating impact that occurs when a person with

³² For example, one issue that raises a question about Mr. Tebbutt's consistency in retelling these events is whether or not the sexual abuse happened on top of or below Jane Doe's clothing. The 2005 polygrapher's report indicated Mr. Tebbutt admitted he "kissed and fondled her bare breasts." However in Mr. Tebbutt's retelling of this story in recent years, IHOP interviewees understood the sexual touching had occurred on top of her clothing.

³³ Diane Langberg, "Sexual Abuse in Christian Organizations."

spiritual authority sexually abuses a minor.³⁴ In addition, framing this issue in terms of whether Mr. Tebbutt engaged with Jane Doe in sexual penetration is a red herring that sidesteps the critical importance of understanding that Mr. Tebbutt nonetheless admitted sexually abusing a minor, and did so by abusing his access to minors granted to him by the church, by exploiting his authority and power over a vulnerable person, and by violating the trust granted him by Jane Doe (and the church). Even if IHOP believes only Mr. Tebbutt's account about the abuse, Mr. Tebbutt's admissions are therefore highly troubling.

In addition, Mr. Tebbutt's acts and omissions after the abuse and since that time raise a number of important questions about his stated repentance for the sexual abuse. Though only God can judge the heart, anyone can see whether a person's words and actions are congruent. Repenting does not mean an absence of consequences. In fact, an abuser who demonstrates authentic repentance will willingly accept whatever consequences provide healing for the one he wounded. In addition, authentic repentance means that an abuser desires and proactively seeks out accountability for his actions and for the distorted patterns of thinking that caused him to engage in such behavior.³⁵ With this in mind, some questions which remain are: Why did Mr. Tebbutt wait for Jane Doe to be the one to report this matter to FBC Modesto? Why did he permit the FBC Modesto leadership to frame this matter as an "affair" rather than as a crime, and as an abuse of power by a person in spiritual authority over a youth? Why did he not turn himself into the police? Why did he not inform his subsequent employers (Alliance Church in Canada, the church in Hillsboro, the church in Puyallup, and the Christian and Missionary Alliance) of this abuse after leaving FBC Modesto? Why did he wait until after being confronted by Jane Doe's pastor to report his abuse to his employer, Christian and Missionary Alliance? Why did he not proactively pursue help for his distorted patterns of thinking, rather waiting to be drawn into this process by his employer in 2004-2005? Why did he continue to pursue employment in churches, ministries, and in a school where he could be granted access and/or placed in positions of leadership and authority over children and youth? Though Mr. Tebbutt replied to a question on the 2012 IHOP internship application that described his version of events, why did he minimize these events? Why, on the 2012 IHOP internship application, did he deny receiving help for "psychological, sexual, emotional, or relational problems"? Why did Mr. Tebbutt stay silent when he applied for an IHOP staff position, and most notably, again when he was considered for the position of Director of Simeon Company? IHOP must thoughtfully consider and address these important questions when making a determination about whether Mr. Tebbutt has demonstrated authentic repentance for the totality of his actions.

Findings of Fact Regarding Part 2: Horizon Christian School in Tualatin, Oregon

GRACE reached out to the Headmaster of Horizon Christian School to ask whether he could provide any

³⁴ As Victor Vieth explains, "When the perpetrator is a member of the clergy, the impact on the victim's spirituality is often heightened. This happens, in part, because clergy abusers often use their religion to justify or excuse their abuse of children and then communicate these cognitive distortions to their victims. In one case, for example, a minister told his daughter that having sex with children is sometimes acceptable and cited God's use of incest at the time of Adam and Eve and after the flood as proof. As a result of this distorted theology, the church attendance of these children decreases, they are less likely to trust God, and their relationship with God 'ceases to grow.'" (Quoting McLaughlin, *Devastated Spirituality*, 145)." Victor I. Vieth, *On This Rock: A Call to Center the Christian Response to Child Abuse on the Life and Words of Jesus* (Eugene: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2018), p. 8. Dr. Diane Langberg also writes, "God is viewed through the lens of abuse. Who he is and what he thinks about the survivor is understood based upon who Daddy was, or Mommy, or a grandfather, or a youth pastor, or whoever. They have learned about love, trust, hope, faith, through the experience of sexual abuse. They have also learned about the unseen through the visible. The ins and outs of ordinary life have taught them many lessons about who they think God is." Diane Langberg, *The Spiritual Impact of Sexual Abuse* (Greensboro: New Growth Press, 2017), p. 6.

³⁵ As child protection expert Victor Vieth explains, "There is, of course, hope for both child abusers and those who enable child abusers. Although God's law is a 'thunderbolt' that 'destroys both the open sinner and the false saint' (BC 312:2), it is not the end of the story. The purpose of the law is to convict us of our sins so that we may turn to Christ for forgiveness." Victor I. Vieth, *On This Rock: A Call to Center the Christian Response to Child Abuse on the Life and Words of Jesus* (Eugene: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2018). Psychologist Diane Langberg similarly puts it this way: "Grace is not a lack of restrictions (P. Monroe). In fact, sometimes the thing that is most grace-filled is restriction. When our God says, do not murder, do not commit adultery- is He not being full of grace to try and prevent us from engaging in those things that will eat us alive? We do so with our own children when we say, do not play in the street. The restriction is full of love and grace. Abusers need that grace extended to them. They have spent years playing in the street of deception, evil, and abuse damaging both their victims and themselves. To say to the abuser, no, you cannot stay in the pulpit; no, you cannot simply transfer to a different ministry is not an assault on their dignity; it is not an accusation; it is not even a failure to trust (though not trusting them is wise it is a keen awareness that their sensibility to sin has been so deadened that they cannot see clearly and are in great danger of further destroying their own soul, not to mention other vulnerable sheep. Of course, we need to protect the vulnerable- our God calls us to that and over again, but we are also protecting the abuser from his own habituated sin and deadness." Diane Langberg, "Sexual Abuse in Christian Organizations."

information regarding this matter. GRACE also asked the Headmaster if he would be willing to inform parents, students, teachers, and any other individuals with possible relevant information about Mr. Tebbutt to contact GRACE. The Headmaster declined to speak with GRACE.³⁶ No individual provided GRACE with information related to Part 2 of the scope of the investigation. As previously noted, GRACE also reached out to Brad Tebbutt. GRACE would have inquired about Mr. Tebbutt's history at Horizon Christian School; however, Mr. Tebbutt declined to speak with GRACE. Consequently, GRACE has no information to report relative to Part 2 of the scope from the Engagement Agreement.

Analysis of Part 2

To date, no information has been provided to GRACE regarding any reports of alleged sexual misconduct or sexual abuse by Brad Tebbutt allegedly committed by Brad Tebbutt during his tenure at Horizon Christian School. Accordingly, GRACE has no analysis to provide regarding this segment of the scope of the Engagement Agreement.

Findings of Fact Regarding Part 3: Allegations of abuse/misconduct by Brad Tebbutt at IHOP

IHOP sent notice of GRACE's survey to approximately 311 individuals. The survey asked individuals if they had knowledge of any sexual misconduct or sexual abuse allegedly committed by Mr. Tebbutt. GRACE also reached out to Mr. Tebbutt for an interview. GRACE would have inquired about Mr. Tebbutt's history at IHOP; however as previously noted, Mr. Tebbutt declined to speak with GRACE. To date, GRACE has received no information pertaining to Mr. Tebbutt's engaging in sexual misconduct or sexual abuse while at IHOP, as described in Part 3 of the scope of the Engagement Agreement.³⁷

Analysis of Part 3

No information was provided to GRACE regarding any reports of alleged sexual misconduct or sexual abuse by Brad Tebbutt allegedly committed by Brad Tebbutt at IHOP. Accordingly, GRACE has no analysis to provide regarding this segment of the scope of the Engagement Agreement.

III. Findings of Fact and Analysis Regarding IHOP's Response to the Allegations³⁸

A) Findings of Fact Regarding IHOP's Knowledge of the Allegations and How it Responded

As previously noted, when Mr. Tebbutt applied in 2012 as an intern to IHOP, the internship application asked him about any accusations of physical or sexual abuse. In answer to this question, Mr. Tebbutt stated that while he was an intern in youth ministry, he "moved outside of [his] marriage to find emotional fulfillment" with a 16 year old girl which "went no further than inappropriate touch."³⁹ Despite this admission, Mr. Tebbutt was admitted into an IHOP internship. The President stated that getting into an IHOP internship to complete a three to six month

³⁶ In one response to GRACE's requests for an interview, Horizon Christian School's Headmaster responded: "Thank you for your inquiry. Relative to your investigation, we have communicated to our constituents and suggested that anyone with information contact the proper authorities. Beyond that, we would cooperate with any law enforcement agency's investigation. We do not participate in independent investigations by agencies other than police or other law enforcement bureaus." Email dated May 30, 2018. GRACE would have requested, among other things, all employment and personnel records relating to Mr. Tebbutt's time at Horizon Christian School, including any information regarding Mr. Tebbutt's departure from Horizon Christian School.

³⁷ GRACE noted that the character information provided by survey respondents and interviewees regarding Mr. Tebbutt was generally positive. The overall responses from those who knew him described Mr. Tebbutt as quiet, humble, and kind.

³⁸ As previously noted, this section of the scope in the Engagement Agreement states, "The scope of this investigation shall also include a) whether IHOP had knowledge of any such allegations and how it responded, and b) assess the actions the current IHOP leadership has taken since being notified of the sexual abuse allegations against Brad Tebbutt."

³⁹ Mr. Tebbutt explained in his internship application, "There was a situation while I was an intern in youth ministry in 1986/87 where I moved outside of my marriage to find emotional fulfillment. This was damaging as it not only violated my marriage with [my wife] but also involved a young girl who was 16 years old. Although my involvement with this young lady went no further than inappropriate touch, it definitely caused deep wounds for her and completely communicated a conflicting message of God's love and of her own sexuality. I have, on two occasions, taken steps to bring resolution and healing into her life and this situation. Our most recent communication has indicated God's redemptive work in her life has brought wholeness. This was an isolated situation in my life that caused me to make corrections and strengthen myself and my marriage. I have two men in my life who are familiar with this situation or have researched the specifics and walked with me through the most recent efforts of reconciliation. They would be happy to speak with you as references in this matter."

training course is "an easy entry point."⁴⁰ An IHOP leader explained, "[The President of IHOP] is very inclusive and wants everybody to be a part, even if we have a really good reason to keep someone out. He always wants to give someone a second chance and a fresh start..."⁴¹ The President also stated, "But I would expect our leaders to flag anyone who has committed a crime or has shown ungodly actions in their lifestyle."⁴² However, a key IHOP leader over the internships indicated that none of the individuals who reviewed Mr. Tebbutt's application had any training to do so.⁴³ This IHOP leader explained that the individuals who reviewed the internship applications had the authority to determine based on their own discretion whether the applicant's explanation about issues raised in the application had been "resolved." If it was "resolved," then the IHOP leader overseeing the internships would not have heard about the issue. He also noted that those reviewing applications were reviewing hundreds of applications. In addition, leaders were often "understaffed" and as a result, things "would fall through the cracks."⁴⁴ GRACE received no information from IHOP identifying which IHOP representative reviewed Mr. Tebbutt's application, nor how he or she had reviewed, processed, and accepted his application in light of this information.

When Mr. Tebbutt applied to be IHOP staff⁴⁵ in 2013, the staff application had a significant gap because it did not ask any questions about prior conduct that may have elicited responses about Mr. Tebbutt's alleged sexual misconduct or other alleged criminal acts. Accordingly, Mr. Tebbutt did not voluntarily provide any information about Jane Doe and the abuse to IHOP when he requested that IHOP consider him for this staff position. The President similarly stated that transitioning from an internship to a staff position does not require "a heavy vetting if their application is approved and if they acted in a responsible way during their internship. But we keep our eye on it to make sure they aren't lying and engaging in sexual things, etc."

In 2015, IHOP elevated Mr. Tebbutt to Director of the Simeon Company Internship.⁴⁶ No one in IHOP leadership reported knowing anything about these allegations when Mr. Tebbutt transitioned from staff to being named the Director of the Simeon Company Internship. An IHOP leader explained that there is "no process" for transitioning

⁴⁰ The President explained, "There is a fairly simple vetting process to come and learn in our midst as an intern - again, it is similar to accepting someone's application to come to a university. If you do not have a history as a trouble-maker and so forth-many interns come to IHOP for spiritual enrichment or to find healing for their life. Some of them have issues that need healing. Obviously, we don't want criminals in our midst. But it's not uncommon for some interns to have issues-some might have struggled with suicide or depression or whatever. Hundreds and hundreds are coming."

⁴¹ This person also explained that "As issues arose, things tightened." The President said he thought this characterization was a fair one and explained that he is "a cheerleader for getting people's lives changed. I want them to join us but I want people who sincerely want to live godly and to follow the Lord. I am not okay with people continuing to do the things that they have been healed from and changed from. You do have to change."

⁴² The President explained, "There are different level of vetting. But if they are joining the children's ministry, that is an intense vetting process. That is really a high vetting process. But if they are coming to the program to sit in class and if they don't cause trouble, their application is accepted pretty easily."

⁴³ This IHOP leader stated, "We have not had any formal training [to review the applications]. It was always very loose. If you could breathe then someone could come on staff." He also explained that the core leaders reviewing the applications "made judgment calls on who to accept and there was no training. Applicants had to give three references: a pastoral reference, a personal reference, and a work reference. I didn't give much credence to the personal reference because you can find anyone. I got a spousal consent because we had guys leaving their families. If everything looked good then they totally had the ability to let them into the internship. We try to get a broad range of people. Sometimes if it was iffy they would call a pastoral reference and call them if they needed more information or a reference." This IHOP leader also noted, "We have three to four guys that were over that part of [reviewing applications] so what would have happened is that they read through [Mr. Tebbutt's application] and saw that and asked him more about it. If it was a current issue and unresolved, then and only then would I may be notified of it. If it was something he said was 30 years ago, and he said it was resolved, then I would never know about it or have ever heard about it."

⁴⁴ This IHOP leader explained, "My entire experience at IHOP has been an experience of growing and having my eyes opened as a leader but we were always understaffed. It always felt like we had more work to do than could possibly get done and there were lots of things that would fall through the cracks so the attitude from any leader down was to make it happen and do what you could and if it didn't get done it didn't get done. It was not professional in that sense. We worked 50 hours a week but only worked 20-25 hours and the other 20-25 hours we were in the prayer room." Another IHOP leader stated, "[c]oming from a more traditional working environment, understanding the process here [at IHOP] hurts my head because it is a missionary base, from my perspective. There doesn't seem to be the same type of coming on board process as there is in a more traditional church or business marketplace environment."

⁴⁵ IHOP representatives explained that the term "staff" is somewhat of a "misnomer." Being "staff" does not mean that the person is a paid employee. Rather it means that the person has raised or will raise their own financial support and is committing themselves full time or part time to IHOP's programs and ministries. The President stated that in 2012 IHOP had approximately 1000 staff members. Currently, IHOP has about 600 to 700 staff members.

⁴⁶ An IHOP leader indicated that Mr. Tebbutt would have received a small stipend for this particular position.

from staff to Director. He explained, "If you do a good job on staff and [we] look at candidates based on whether we like them, can they fulfill the role and can we get along with them well since we spend so much time together, that is how [Mr. Tebbutt] was invited into the role. He didn't apply but there was an opening and we prayed about it and asked him, and that is how he became a Director."⁴⁷ This gap, according to the President, was IHOP's biggest weakness relative to Mr. Tebbutt's association with IHOP. He explained, "going from the generic 'missionary staff' to our leadership is a big step. That is where the intense vetting comes in. I asked them [regarding Mr. Tebbutt's promotion], 'why didn't you look at that?' They said, 'Uhhh' and I would say, 'wow, that is not a good answer.'"

Analysis: Protocols and Education

IHOP appears to be aware that several gaps have existed in these processes. Improved vetting of internship applicants by utilizing best practices is necessary so that IHOP can be aware of who is entering the organization. Closing any gaps regarding all internship and staff applications by asking the right questions at every level⁴⁸ of entry and transition within IHOP is unquestionably a critical starting point. However, Christian organizations must always remember that, undoubtedly, while improving policies and protocols are important in processing issues that arise, it is the attitudes, the culture, and the priorities of an institution that will have the greatest impact on safety. No policy or protocol can, by itself, prevent abuse. But creating, reviewing, and, of course, following safeguarding protocols adopted by the institution are a first step in responding appropriately to sexual misconduct.

In addition to closing application gaps, IHOP should have proactively pursued learning as much information as possible about the true nature of all of Mr. Tebbutt's alleged criminal behavior through any and all available sources, including contacting Jane Doe to find out her version of events before he was granted admission, and certainly before he was granted a leadership position. Even though IHOP's position has been that anyone who is not "a troublemaker" can initially become an intern and get into the training course, this information would have been useful when Mr. Tebbutt was considered for a staff position, and ultimately for the Simeon Company Director's position. Mr. Tebbutt's admission alone, regardless of whether he committed the act of sexual penetration, should have been enough to prohibit him from working in a leadership and/or pastoral role. Conducting a rigorous and thorough screening process for all applicants, and especially for candidates being considered for leadership positions, is essential for many reasons, including the fact that they can have regular contact with the wounded, youth, and other vulnerable people. Accordingly, maintaining internal screening processes is a critical need before elevating anyone to a position of leadership.

Being proactive about understanding sexual abuse (and understanding admissions related to sexual offenses) is important because sexual offenders possess unique characteristics that make the commission of their offenses possible. As Dr. Anna Salter explains, deception and secrecy are the "lifeblood of sexual aggression."⁴⁹ Appreciating, therefore, the danger of sexual offenders is even more important for Christian organizations⁵⁰ because "[i]t is precisely our lack of knowledge and understanding that gives predators their edge."⁵¹ The combination of not knowing the truth about a perpetrator's past (particularly if they plan to return to the organization) and not understanding the dynamics of offenders is what makes predators so dangerous, particularly in religious settings. As ugly as these truths may be, being fully aware of the reality of a perpetrator's history is one of the best and most important ways to protect the organization's people. Believing that a person we love or respect is capable of sexual misconduct is usually difficult to accept. However, drawing conclusions about sexual conduct based upon what we believe we know about a person's character, or based solely upon the accused's own version of events, can be misleading and sometimes dangerous. As Dr. Diane Langberg explains, "[w]e may think

⁴⁷ IHOP's Due Diligence Report similarly notated that IHOP has "no internal staff process for internal promotion."

⁴⁸ One reason this is important is because, though Mr. Tebbutt's case did not provide evidence of this issue, a person could have engaged in intervening criminal activity between the time of the initial internship application and a later staff application.

⁴⁹ Anna Salter, *Predators, Pedophiles, Rapists and Other Sex Offenders: Who They Are, How They Operate, and How We Can Protect Ourselves and Our Children*, 2003.

⁵⁰ Dr. Anna Salter explains, "One molester, who was himself a minister, said 'I consider church people easy to fool... they have a trust that comes from being Christians... They tend to be better folks all around. And they seem to want to believe in the good that exists in all people.... I think they want to believe in people. And because of that, you can easily convince, with or without convincing words.'" *Predators, Pedophiles, Rapists and Other Sex Offenders: Who They Are, How They Operate, and How We Can Protect Ourselves and Our Children*, Anna Salter, 2003.

⁵¹ *Id.*

we know people, but God says we do not.”⁵² Ongoing education about these issues is an investment in IHOP’s people. Just as IHOP maintains its grounds or fixes a broken window, continuing safeguarding education must be an ongoing commitment for the health of any organization that is committed to preventing abuse and supporting survivors. Just as one expects attorneys, teachers, physicians and so forth to be lifelong learners, educating all demographics of the church body about the dynamics of abuse and the dangers of how offenders operate must be a top and ongoing priority. An institution’s failure to be proactive about these issues means that its people are more vulnerable to exploitation, offenders are not held accountable for known offenses, and IHOP risks communicating the message that its organization is a safe place for sexual offenders to operate undetected.

Actions taken by current leadership since being notified of the sexual abuse allegations

After the media contacted IHOP, IHOP engaged in a number of positive and important initial steps in understanding organizational weaknesses that led to this crisis. Hiring GRACE as an external third party and conducting a preliminary investigation that resulted in IHOP’s Due Diligence Report and Timeline are examples of helpful actions that were aimed at addressing institutional weaknesses.⁵³ In addition, the President and several other leaders have indicated that “there have been a lot of things that we have changed.” Examples provided from IHOP leaders relating to changes at IHOP have been closing the gap on the staff application, having increased numbers of individuals review the applications, asking “pointed” questions of applicants,⁵⁴ and “increas[ing] the vetting process for joining our leadership team.”⁵⁵ Though some positive steps have been taken, several weaknesses relative to IHOP’s handling of these matters after it learned of Mr. Tebbutt’s abuse must be addressed going forward.

First, a concern was raised that IHOP did not have “a fire” under them for addressing this matter. Specifically, according to an IHOP leader, the news media contacted IHOP and indicated that it was seeking information regarding the allegations against Mr. Tebbutt because it planned to run a news story. This IHOP leader explained that though they had been contacted by the media, the matter “died down and we didn’t do anything until the [news media] report was released... [which was] three weeks later. We were slowly doing an investigation but there wasn’t any kind of fire under us.” In addition, this leader noted that at times during these events, “it was unclear who was leading the process.”

Second, a number of IHOP leaders explained that disagreement existed about whether Mr. Tebbutt should be placed on administrative leave during the pendency of the investigation. One leader explained, “[The President] said if we should put [Mr. Tebbutt] on administrative leave, that it would communicate that we were not standing with/being loyal to [Mr. Tebbutt].” This IHOP leader noted, “I had a number of other women in the ministry and in my life that were like, ‘What the heck?’” Other individuals similarly noted that IHOP leaders floundered about whether to keep Mr. Tebbutt in leadership, after learning of his abuse allegations. Referring to this time period when IHOP had not yet made a decision about whether to put Mr. Tebbutt on administrative leave, an IHOP leader explained that the internship staff team had a meeting. In the meeting, “Everybody wanted to keep [Mr. Tebbutt] as Director [of the Simeon Internship] and they were fighting for him to keep his position and stay involved in ministry work.” This leader however believed that Mr. Tebbutt “doesn’t need to be in ministry anymore.” He stated, “I was disappointed that those in highest leadership had the goal to get him back in ministry again. Nowhere in that conversation did I hear anybody concerned about [Mr. Tebbutt’s] wife and kids and who is going to take care of them during this time. It seems like the focus is on ministry and not the person.” This interviewee further explained that some within IHOP leadership “equated not standing with [Mr. Tebbutt] as not

⁵² Diane Langberg, “Sexual Abuse in Christian Organizations.”

⁵³ IHOP also made an effort to reach out to Jane Doe during this time, however, she was unresponsive.

⁵⁴ Notably, when asked how Mr. Tebbutt’s application would be handled today, a top IHOP leader who oversees the internships told GRACE, “It would come up and come to me and I would come to the conversation but I don’t know if I would reject someone related to that story or dig a layer deeper....”

⁵⁵ The President told GRACE, “I think about two to three years before this— with awareness of what was happening in our culture in the USA, we started tightening up our vetting processes a lot more eyeballs and reports and vetting and we checked out people who were vetted. Now we have at least two to three leaders looking at potential new leaders before they go to the next stage of being accepted into a leadership role. There is much more accountability today. We care about due diligence. I think we cannot do too much due diligence. The issue with [Mr. Tebbutt] has definitely increased our vetting process, but two years before that, or three years, the awareness of what is happening in the culture, we have more eyeballs on the situation—we have more people reading reports and then checking the new people asking, ‘hey are you sure that you have references on this new guy?’”

caring about him and said to put him back in his position. I don't see those as the same. You can still stand with [Mr. Tebbutt] and care about him but give him time to step down and sort this out...." Though IHOP did ultimately ask that Mr. Tebbutt step out of his position pending the results of the investigation, this IHOP leader observed, "It is almost like the highest or underlying value is 'the right position fixes everything.' So in [Mr. Tebbutt's] case, it was like he was having these issues and 'we don't want him to fall away or backslide so let's keep him in the right position moving forward' is viewed as the right idea." Simeon Company core leaders also recalled that on the Tuesday following the public reports by the media about Mr. Tebbutt, IHOP leadership came to the Simeon class and indicated to them "that IHOP takes it seriously and that they also love [Mr. Tebbutt] and want to honor him" and therefore Mr. Tebbutt would stay in leadership. However on Thursday of the same week, IHOP leadership returned to the Simeon class and announced that "the base had to be more deliberate about this than they originally thought and that [Mr. Tebbutt] was going to have to step down."⁵⁶ One of the core leaders described the "back and forth" from the leadership as "trauma"⁵⁷ because IHOP did not have a plan in place.⁵⁸ Consequently, this leader felt abandoned and eventually left the internship.⁵⁹

Third, when asked about whether IHOP had a plan in place to care for survivors of sexual abuse or for any others impacted by this news, an IHOP leader stated he "had never seen or heard anything like that." This leader also recalled that some individuals "had a real hard time being in the same room with [Mr. Tebbutt, after the news broke]. I spent a lot of time with them praying and again trying to help them come to grips with whether he did or didn't do it. The position right now is praying for the situation and not working with [Mr. Tebbutt] or being next to [Mr. Tebbutt]. I had people on my staff who were almost traumatized just by him being around." He also provided the following example:

One girl pulled me aside the first day I was back. [Mr. Tebbutt] would participate with our team when we had training as the liaison to speak and invite them to consider doing an internship. The week I got back [Mr. Tebbutt] was on the schedule to do that and she asked if he was going to be here. She said if [Mr. Tebbutt] is going to be here I can't come and be in the same room with him. I didn't know he was going to come so I switched it and he didn't come because he shouldn't be standing for IHOP while he is going with that. She works with kids all week that go through these situations. I don't know her background but it was hard on her. She wouldn't have come if he did and she probably would have left staff if he would have stayed on staff.

A leader within the Simeon Internship similarly relayed, "There were some people who struggled with the allegations, but mostly because it was their own experiences but not because anybody had any experiences with [Mr. Tebbutt]." This person noted, "Our internship had mostly women and most women over 55 have experienced

⁵⁶ When GRACE discussed with a top IHOP leader that witnesses had stated that he had an initial meeting with Simeon interns and core leaders where he indicated that IHOP was standing by Mr. Tebbutt, and then another meeting a few days later where the interns and core leaders were told that Mr. Tebbutt was stepping down, this IHOP leader told GRACE, "That is not accurate. It was out of my hands. I would not have said that because I would not have wanted to represent leadership from that way. I am guessing what is being reflected before the process began was when [Mr. Tebbutt] came first to us. I don't know what [he] initially told his team."

⁵⁷ This leader explained, "The trauma didn't set in until leadership started changing their story. When I say changing their story, I mean saying one day we are behind [Mr. Tebbutt] and he is going to stay in his role, to two days later saying he was stepping down and that we were on our own.... What I mean by that, because it went back and forth, I understand leadership didn't have a grid but they came into the internship classroom with the interns and said in public to our internship interns and to our team that they were behind [Mr. Tebbutt] and he is staying put. Then two days later they came into the internship class and said he was being asked to step aside for an unknown season and did not notify leadership ahead of time and they told us that we could not be in contact with him and he was no longer our leader. The trauma [for me] was not the story itself with the charges, but it was how it was handled."

⁵⁸ This individual explained, "On a broader scale I would like to see [IHOP] have a little more structure in place so that when things happen, and not even like this, but had some accident happened to [Mr. Tebbutt], we would still be in the end result even though the circumstances were different. It appears to me that there are not structures in place in several places that I have experienced on the base where a leader or key person is out of commission for whatever reason and the next people on the totem pole don't have the equipping or support they need to carry on. To me that is one of the biggest things is a preparation of successors.... I don't see planning in place. I am not engaged or involved so I don't know what they have in place but from my firsthand experience there was nothing in place to support the team that was left. For any organization to continue, there has to be some sort of framework and structure in place for it to continue unless the desire is for it not to continue."

⁵⁹ In addition, this interviewee noted, "I was told several times that someone from pastoral support was going to contact me and I have never been contacted by anybody to ask how I am been dealing with this.... I was told the generic counseling area of pastoral staff was going to contact me and nobody did. I was in survival mode from that point on because my biggest concern was our interns and my secondary concern were our other leaders and then my concern was myself."

something in their life of a level of sexual trauma. So sometimes from a counseling perspective when you hear something, it starts to trigger your own stuff." The leader further explained, "One of the other girls I work with, [this situation] triggered a very traumatic experience she went through, not with a leader but someone attacked her.... [She] had never spoken to anyone about it and it happened to her when she was [age]. It was still highly traumatic for her. That is the thing: whatever side of this you are on as to who you believe, the truth is that the collateral impact and consequences are triggering other people's own stuff. And we need to help them navigate that. She didn't get a call from anyone to help her walk through her own stuff either."

Analysis: Prioritizing the Wounded

In addition to the previously described need for robust screening of all candidates and proactive education regarding sex offender dynamics, an additional area of fundamental concern raised by these findings is IHOP's failure to prioritize the wounded.⁶⁰ As one IHOP leader explained, there was not a "fire" under them to deal with this matter until after the media actually reported these events. First, prioritizing the wounded means IHOP would not have waited to learn as much as possible about Mr. Tebbutt's offense until the media reported this news story. IHOP should have attempted to learn as much as possible about these events at the time Mr. Tebbutt initially applied. When he was being considered for the Simeon Company's Director position, IHOP missed another opportunity to review Mr. Tebbutt's previously submitted applications and conduct a thorough review of his background, which should have included reaching out to Jane Doe prior to the time of his promotion to Director. Doing so would have given IHOP additional information about these events, and it would have also provided IHOP with the opportunity to communicate to Jane Doe, to survivors who are watching, and to any other sexual offenders that the church does not tolerate abuse, that it does not protect sexual offenders from justice, and that it cares for, protects, and defends the vulnerable.

Second, prioritizing the wounded means that IHOP would not have permitted Mr. Tebbutt to remain in a position of leadership for several weeks, or even for a few days. As previously stated, no person came forward to identify Mr. Tebbutt as a perpetrator of a sexual offense at IHOP. This may of course be because Mr. Tebbutt did not sexually abuse anyone at IHOP. However, allowing Mr. Tebbutt to remain in a visible position of authority and responsibility at IHOP after these events became fully known by IHOP's leadership was not likely to encourage any potential victims from speaking out. Every passing day that abuse remains undisclosed is a day that those who are suffering silently could be receiving the professional help they so desperately need.⁶¹ Furthermore, IHOP's initial indecision and poor communications about Mr. Tebbutt's administrative leave does not add to the belief that IHOP actively supports, protects, and cares for the vulnerable. For survivors, silence about sexual abuse is associated with secrecy and shame. Institutional responses lacking transparency cause victims to feel devalued and serve as "triggers" because the response fails to prioritize the disclosures of sexual abuse. Instead, IHOP risked communicating to its people, to Mr. Tebbutt, and to other sexual offenders that IHOP is a safer place for perpetrators than it is for the wounded.

Third, when sexual misconduct allegations emerge within any institution, that institution, particularly one which calls upon the name of Jesus, must take proactive and appropriate steps to care for those who are wounded by it. Sexual abuse impacts individuals differently and each processes in different ways and on varying timetables the grief, betrayal, and losses that accompany this devastating revelation that one of its trusted leaders engaged in clergy sexual abuse with a minor. For survivors, synthesizing this information often brings back painful memories of their own experiences (even though Mr. Tebbutt was not reported to be that person's abuser), and therefore

⁶⁰ In Matthew 19:13-15 ("Then children were brought to him that he might lay his hands on them and pray. The disciples rebuked the people, but Jesus said, 'Let the little children come to me and do not hinder them, for to such belongs the kingdom of heaven.'"), Jesus clearly communicates his priority of loving and valuing those who society did not consider valuable.

⁶¹ According to most estimates, approximately 20% of the population has experienced some form of sexual abuse before turning 18 years old. Christian communities are no exception. Considered the "classic study of adult women in the population," (Salter) Dr. Diane Russell found that 28% of women had been molested as children before they reached the age of 14 and 38% of women had been molested before they reached the age of 18. This study included physical contact offenses only (and excluded exhibitionism and nonviolent contact between peers). Of these, only 5% of the child sexual abuse had ever been reported to law enforcement. See Russell (1984; 2000); see also Finkelhor, Hotaling, Lewis, and Smith (1990); Salter (1992); Wyatt and Powell (1988). According to various studies, approximately 9% to 16% of boys in the United States are molested before they reach the age of 18. See Badgley (1984); Salter (1992); Timnick (1985a; 1985b). The Finkelhor study found that 33% of women and 42% of men failed to report that they had been sexually assaulted until asked (Finkelhor, Hotaling, Lewis, and Smith, 1990).

weak or nonexistent institutional responses can reopen wounds and reinforce feelings of worthlessness and isolation. Added to this are additional layers of complexity: how sexual abuse by clergy impacts a victim's faith and his or her perception of God, questions about forgiveness, questions about the power and authority of the church, its obligations to respond, protect, and care, and so much more. All of these issues can impact not only victims, but learning of abuse by a trusted Christian leader can be traumatic for friends, colleagues, family members of the parties, and for the church as a whole, as it often raises questions about whether it is possible to trust the offender ever again, whether others can be trusted, and for some, whether it is even possible to trust God. And for those who are not believers, the watching world sees a Christian institution that did not take the most basic steps of being "Good Samaritans"⁶² by caring for the wounded. IHOP leadership must take care to identify the varying needs of all of its people early on as a part of the ongoing crisis intervention and healing process.

An institution's failure to prioritize the wounded creates several significant problems: it puts vulnerable individuals and youth at risk; it harms survivors by reinforcing feelings of worthlessness, shame, blame, and helplessness because the church has chosen to place the needs of the perpetrator over the needs of survivors; it creates a safe haven for abusers, rather than the abused; and it communicates to perpetrators that safety is not the church's highest priority. The bottom line is that churches that are vocal about the realities of abuse by addressing it transparently through education, sermons, support, and care for survivors are communicating a clear message: your pain is not too much for us to bear. You who have survived it will not be forced to survive it alone. Transforming our churches and faith communities into places of refuge for those who have been violated, judged, and marginalized is what the gospel is all about. If God is our refuge, then our churches must be the places where these precious souls find safety and rest.

IV. Conclusion

Though evidence was not raised during the pendency of this investigation that Mr. Tebbutt sexually abused a person within the IHOP community, the evidence shows that Mr. Tebbutt repeatedly exploited the access and trust granted him by Jane Doe and by the church by sexually abusing a youth in his care from a position of spiritual authority. A number of significant data points previously described, not the least of which include Mr. Tebbutt's "vague" responses to this matter in 2018 and his explanation of these events in 2012 on his internship application, demonstrate that Mr. Tebbutt minimizes or fails to appreciate the gravity of his potentially criminal and clearly destructive sinful behaviors.

Environments that draw vulnerable people must be places that prioritize the abused, not the abuser. Prioritizing the wounded and vulnerable, which is at the heart of the gospel message, must be a part of every institution's DNA. In so doing, utilizing protocols consistent with best practices for receiving and reviewing applications, screening applicants, and considering candidates for promotion becomes second nature. In addition, proactively engaging in church wide education regarding victim and offender dynamics enables leaders (and all of the church body) to have a better understanding of these critical issues. Finally, prioritizing the wounded means that institutional leaders engage in immediate, healthy, and transparent communications to encourage, pursue, and care for those who are wounded and hurting. Failure to do so sends the wrong messages to offenders who see a failed institutional response, to the outside world who is watching, to brave individuals who report abuse, and to victims who are watching and suffering in silence.

Recommendations

- Outline a plan demonstrating authentic repentance (i.e., actions and words)⁶³ addressed to survivors and any other IHOP representatives who may have been injured by IHOP's response.
- Decide whether Brad Tebbutt will be permitted to return to IHOP. Without a proven demonstration of authentic repentance, Brad Tebbutt's employment and association with IHOP should be terminated. Should he be permitted to return to IHOP, he must never be allowed on the property when minors are present. In addition, he must never be allowed at, or granted participation in, any off-campus IHOP activities in which minors are present.
- Send a letter to all of Brad Tebbutt's former employers and ministries notifying them of Brad Tebbutt's sexual abuse history so that they can inform individuals in their congregations/ministries who may be impacted by these alleged crimes.
- Create a Safeguarding Committee that will:
 - Be a support ministry for survivors of sexual abuse
 - Facilitate ongoing sexual abuse and offender dynamics training for all new and existing employees and for every demographic of the church body (all leaders, volunteers, congregants, parents, children, etc.)
 - Track attendance and completion of training modules
 - Report all sexual misconduct violations to law enforcement and then to Human Resources
 - Review sexual misconduct policies⁶⁴ every 12 months and revise as needed
 - Engage community partners who work in the field of abuse
 - Evaluate facilities for potential blind spots or other safety concerns
 - Implement all recommendations with an appreciation for and an understanding of the spiritual impact which sexual abuse has on those who have been wounded
 - Address any other needs as they arise. The Safeguarding Committee must include at least one survivor⁶⁵ of sexual abuse at all times as well as a community partner, such as a law enforcement officer, prosecutor, or a Child Protective Services caseworker.
- Provide training consistent with best practices for individuals who review all incoming applications.⁶⁶
- Conduct an audit of IHOP's policies⁶⁷ relevant to sexual misconduct and make appropriate revisions. Policy audits must be conducted with a commitment to best practices and an appreciation for trauma, including how abuse dynamics interface with theological concepts such as forgiveness, repentance, reconciliation.⁶⁸

⁶³ Repentance, when founded on truth and humility, is best illustrated by: 1) empathy for those who have been wronged and damaged by sin and failures, 2) an awareness that the offense is against the goodness and holiness of God, not merely a behavior that hurt others, and 3) a desire to make restitution. Words of apology, though good and necessary, are not sufficient evidence of a true turning away from prior wrongdoing. Authentic repentance will be demonstrated by an equally authentic transformation over a period of time where individuals and institutions work to ensure future behaviors no longer harm others. This definition is adapted from an article written by Diane Langberg. See "An Inward Look (Part One and Part Two)," *Christian Counseling Today* Vol. 9 No. 2 (2001).

⁶⁴ Policies should include a specific action plan with concrete steps regarding how IHOP will handle allegations of sexual misconduct when it arises.

⁶⁵ Some of the best experts in the area of sexual abuse are survivors because of the fact they have endured these painful dynamics. Listening to them is one of the most important components in abuse prevention. As many survivors explain, "if you haven't experienced it, it's hard to understand." This sentiment underscores the importance of asking survivors to lead and allowing their voices to be heard. So many of these "overcomers" understand all too well the dynamics of secrecy, shame, blame, loss, grief, reasons for delayed disclosures, grooming tactics, the misuse of power, deception, and so very much more. Survivors can be incredibly intuitive and are often the first to recognize the danger signs of abuse, and the church is therefore wise to listen to them.

⁶⁶ As one top IHOP leader relayed, IHOP may tend to handle problems solely "from a pastoral perspective" rather than from an employer/employee perspective, which can weaken an institution's ability to recognize and respond appropriately to sexual sin. This person explained, "One more thing that is helpful is that you are also hitting up against is that because it is a small organization and it is family and everyone trusts each other and so they don't tell HR because [HR] are the paid guys and they may not feel they need to tell [HR]. They say if they need to handle it they will do so from 'a pastoral perspective' so this is more a cultural issue. There is more involvement that needs to be thought and done here and acknowledged than 'pastoral.' That still does happen and something we are working to change. Leaders are mostly pastors and they think of 'pastoral solutions,' so yes you need to get the guy healed and the lady recovered but there is an 'accidental separation' between the two roles of pastor and HR. You don't need to turn one off and one on. You can have a pastoral heart while having a legal mind toward HR. We are a pastoral people and church family, so how do we have those hats while wearing other hats? We don't just have to think about these things with the employer hat or just think from a family hat. That is something they have been weak at and they have been approaching things from a pastoral, restoration, we believe you, we pray for you to overcome it, but they are also an employer. This has been a weakness for this organization."

- Complete a screening check⁶⁹ of every individual at IHOP who has access or contact with individuals 17 years of age or younger
- Pay for outside counseling for Jane Doe and for those who were injured by IHOP's response to these matters.
- Discuss ways that IHOP can have transparent and healthy conversations that address all forms of abuse including sexual abuse, family violence, non-physical/verbal abuse, and its effects on children and vulnerable adults.
- Complete a seminary training course⁷⁰ on sexual abuse principles related to victims and offenders⁷¹
- Pursue regular opportunities to serve and listen to survivors
- In locations (such as a library) where there are resources about misconduct, review the resources to be sure that materials exist for individuals impacted by abuse. This should include books⁷² and links to *appropriate* counseling in which a licensed clinician is able to provide evidence-based therapy and, within that setting, to also address the spiritual impact of maltreatment.

GRACE also noted that several different individuals brought concerning information to GRACE relating to specific instances of alleged sexual misconduct reportedly committed by other individuals associated with IHOP.⁷³ This information falls outside the scope of this investigation regarding Brad Tebbutt and is therefore not included here but will be addressed in a follow-up communication with IHOP in the coming weeks. These issues must be addressed and GRACE recommends that these matters be promptly investigated. A failure to investigate and implement recommended changes is likely to result in continued missteps when handling and responding to misconduct issues at IHOP.

⁶⁷ "When writing a church policy on child maltreatment, for example, the preamble must remind readers that these policies are not being done to avoid litigation or reduce our insurance rate—but because children are Christ's representatives (Mark 9:36-37) and we intend to treat them with the respect due messengers of God." Victor I. Vieth, *On This Rock: A Call to Center the Christian Response to Child Abuse on the Life and Words of Jesus* (Eugene: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2018).

⁶⁸ GRACE often heard from witnesses about the importance of reconciliation. However, it is important to note that reconciliation may not always be the result of repentance. "Since reconciliation requires at least two parties to agree, it makes for a bad objective since we can't guarantee that the other will be willing, able or ready to reconcile." For more helpful insights about reconciliation, see "Why Reconciliation Isn't the Best Objective" by Dr. Phil Monroe.

⁶⁹ Screening checks include a criminal background check, a references check, an interview, and checking publically available sources as needed, including social media outlets such as Facebook, Twitter, Snapchat, etc.

⁷⁰ According to a 2015 study of the course catalogues of every accredited seminary in the United States, researchers found only 3% of seminaries had a focused course on child maltreatment. Janine Betz, *Analysis of Child Abuse Training at Accredited Seminaries*, unpublished research, Gundersen National Child Protection Training Center (2015).

⁷¹ This recommendation is intended for the President, the CEO, and the COO as they are IHOP's senior leaders within the organization. Other leaders will also find this course useful.

⁷² E.g., Diane Langberg, *Suffering and the Heart of God: How Trauma Destroys and Christ Restores* (Greensboro: New Growth Press 2015).

⁷³ The sexual misconduct allegations relating to other individuals associated with IHOP (not Brad Tebbutt) reportedly occurred at various times during the last 10 years, with the most recent alleged sexual misconduct occurring in 2018.